# **COMMONWEALTH** A Journal of Pennsylvania Politics and Policy

EDITOR-IN-CHIEF	J. Wesley Leckrone, Widener University
MANAGING EDITOR	Michelle J. Atherton, Temple University
ASSOCIATE EDITORS	Christopher Borick, <i>Muhlenberg College</i> Paula A. Duda Holoviak, <i>Kutztown University</i>
	Joseph P. McLaughlin, Jr., Temple University
EDITORIAL ADVISORY	
BOARD	Bruce Caswell, Rowan University
	Beverly A. Cigler, Pennsylvania State University, Harrisburg
	Richardson Dilworth, Drexel University
	John J. Kennedy, West Chester University
	John Kincaid, <i>Lafayette College</i>
	Joseph Marbach, Georgian Court University
	David Y. Miller, University of Pittsburgh
	Megan Mullin, Duke University
	Richard A. Stafford, Carnegie Mellon University
FOUNDING EDITOR	
EMERITUS	Donald G. Tannenbaum, Gettysburg College
EDITORS EMERITUS	Thomas J. Baldino, Wilkes University
	Gerard J. Fitzpatrick, Ursinus College



Published by Temple University Press on behalf of The Pennsylvania Political Science Association

ounded in 1939, the Pennsylvania Political Science Association (PPSA) is the nation's oldest state political science association. Its mission has always been to promote scholarship, research, and the exchange of ideas within the Pennsylvania community of political scientists. PPSA draws its membership principally from the political science and public administration faculties of Pennsylvania's public and private colleges and universities but also includes government professionals and faculty members from surrounding states.

PPSA's annual conference includes dozens of panelists covering a wide variety of subjects. While university faculty compose the vast majority of participants, legislators, legislative staff, executive officials, and undergraduates also have participated. For more information on the activities of PPSA and membership rates, please visit the association's website at <u>http://www.papolisci.org/</u>. *OMMONWEALTH* collaborates with the Pennsylvania Policy Forum to plan special issues and attract high-quality content to the journal. The Forum is a consortium of faculty members and academic and policy institute leaders from Pennsylvania colleges and universities who share an interest in generating ideas, analyses, and symposiums that might prove useful to citizens, elected officials, and civic leaders in addressing major issues confronting the Commonwealth and its local governments. As educators who have helped train students for careers in public policy, members also share an interest in helping to improve the skills, knowledge, and tools of leaders in the public and civic sectors.

Members of the Forum have expertise in public policy analysis as well as a wide range of substantive issues, including but not limited to education, transportation and public infrastructure, economic development, agriculture, energy, elections, water policy and the environment, health care, social policy, urban development, emergency management, information technology, public finance, and constitutional law. Members also share an interest in improving both the policy process itself and the institutional structures through which issues and problems are addressed.

Forum members have contributed to public policy debates in Pennsylvania, and a number have also served in state and local government and in nonprofit and civic organizations that engage in policy development and implementation. Some members of the Forum are associated with other academic and public policy–related organizations, but the Forum itself is independent of these relationships and has no formal connections to any government entity. Members obviously benefit from the intellectual resources and environments of their universities, but unless otherwise indicated, they do not act on behalf of their institutions when they sponsor Forum projects. The premise of the Forum is that through the consortium, members can jointly develop and sponsor nonpartisan research, symposiums, and education and training programs of value to elected officials, civic leaders, and the public and thereby enhance their ability to contribute to more intelligent and informed policy making.

## Contents

#### Virtual Issue Number 1 2020

#### **Editor's Note**

*Commonwealth* Matters: Introduction to Virtual Issue on Controversial Issues in Pennsylvania Politics and Policy

J. Wesley Leckrone, Editor-in-Chief

#### State Government

Commonwealth Forum: Should Pennsylvania Adopt Direct Democracy?

*Commonwealth* Forum: Does Pennsylvania Need a Large, Full-Time Legislature?

*Commonwealth* Forum: Do Businesspeople Make Good Chief Executives?

### Elections

*Commonwealth* Forum: Should Pennsylvania Adopt a Citizens' Redistricting Commission to Draw Congressional Districts?

Commonwealth Forum: Should Pennsylvania Adopt Early Voting?

#### **Budgeting and Taxes**

*Commonwealth* Forum: Addressing Pennsylvania's Structural Budget Deficit

Revitalizing Pennsylvania Through Government Reform *Bob Dick* 

The Continuing Pennsylvania Crisis in Perspective *Marc Stier* 

*Commonwealth* Forum: Should Pennsylvania Abolish the Property Tax? Part I

*Commonwealth* Forum: Should Pennsylvania Rely on Sin Taxes for Revenue?

Commonwealth Forum: Should Pennsylvania Tax Retirement Income?

*Commonwealth* Forum: Should Pennsylvania Enact a Natural Gas Severance Tax?

#### **Public Policy Issues**

*Commonwealth* Forum: Should Pennsylvania Abolish the Property Tax? Part II

Yes, Abolish the Property Tax: It Is the Worst Tax for Schools David G. Argall and John Hopcraft

No, Keep the Property Tax: *It Is the Best Tax for Schools William A. Fischel* 

*Commonwealth* Forum: Should Pennsylvania Enact Work Requirements for Medicaid Recipients?

*Commonwealth* Forum: Would Mandated Paid Leave Be a Competitive Disadvantage for Pennsylvania?

*Commonwealth* Forum: Should State Government Subsidizee the Economic Development of Natural Gas Facilities?

*Commonwealth* Forum: Should Pennsylvania End the Practice of Hold-Harmless Funding?

*Commonwealth* Forum: Should the State Provide Support to Rural Hospitals?

Commonwealth Forum: Should Pennsylvania Allow Safe Injection Sites?