

COMMONWEALTH

A Journal of Pennsylvania Politics and Policy

EDITOR-IN-CHIEF J. Wesley Leckrone, *Widener University*

**BOOK REVIEW EDITOR/
ASSOCIATE EDITOR** Thomas J. Baldino, *Wilkes University*

ASSOCIATE EDITORS Michelle J. Atherton, *Temple University*
Christopher Borick, *Muhlenberg College*
Paula Holoviak, *Kutztown University*
Joseph P. McLaughlin, Jr., *Temple University*

EDITORIAL ADVISORY

BOARD Bruce Caswell, *Rowan University*
Beverly A. Cigler, *Pennsylvania State University, Harrisburg*
Richardson Dilworth, *Drexel University*
John J. Kennedy, *West Chester University*
John Kincaid, *Lafayette College*
David Y. Miller, *University of Pittsburgh*
Joseph Marbach, *Georgian Court University*
Megan Mullin, *Duke University*
Richard A. Stafford, *Carnegie Mellon University*

COPY EDITOR Barbara Crawford

EDITORIAL ASSISTANT Nicole Crossey, *Widener University*

**FOUNDING EDITOR
EMERITUS** Donald G. Tannenbaum, *Gettysburg College*

EDITORS EMERITUS Thomas J. Baldino, *Wilkes University*
Gerard J. Fitzpatrick, *Ursinus College*



Published by Temple University Press on behalf of
The Pennsylvania Political Science Association

THE PENNSYLVANIA POLITICAL SCIENCE ASSOCIATION

OFFICERS AND EXECUTIVE COUNCIL

2015–2016

PRESIDENT

Christopher Borick
Muhlenberg College

FIRST VICE PRESIDENT

Steven Peterson
*Pennsylvania State University,
Harrisburg*

SECOND VICE PRESIDENT

Lanethea Mathews-Schultz
Muhlenberg College

TREASURER

Steven B. Lem
Kutztown University

SECRETARY

Paula Holoviak
Kutztown University

EXECUTIVE COUNCIL

2013–2016

Joseph P. McLaughlin, Jr.
Temple University

2014–2017

Michelle DeMary
Susquehanna University

2015–2018

Michelle J. Atherton
Temple University

Ayesha Ray
King's College

Kyle Kreider
Wilkes University

Michael Greenberg
Shippensburg University

EX OFFICIO MEMBERS

PAST PRESIDENT

Brooke Harlowe
Lock Haven University

PAST PRESIDENT

Stanley Berard
Lock Haven University

EDITORIAL STAFF OF COMMONWEALTH: *A Journal of Pennsylvania Politics and Policy*

EDITOR-IN-CHIEF

J. Wesley Leckrone
Widener University

ASSOCIATE EDITOR & BOOK REVIEW EDITOR

Thomas J. Baldino
Wilkes University

EDITOR EMERITUS

Gerard J. Fitzpatrick
Ursinus College

FOUNDING EDITOR EMERITUS

Donald G. Tannenbaum
Gettysburg College

Pennsylvania Policy Forum

COMMONWEALTH collaborates with the Pennsylvania Policy Forum to plan special issues and attract high-quality content to the journal. The Forum is a consortium of faculty members and academic and policy institute leaders from Pennsylvania colleges and universities who share an interest in generating ideas, analyses, and symposiums that might prove useful to citizens, elected officials, and civic leaders in addressing major issues confronting the Commonwealth and its local governments. As educators who have helped train students for careers in public policy, members also share an interest in helping to improve the skills, knowledge, and tools of leaders in the public and civic sectors.

Members of the Forum have expertise in not only public policy analysis but also a wide range of substantive issues, including but not limited to education, transportation and public infrastructure, economic development, agriculture, energy, elections, water policy and the environment, health care, social policy, urban development, emergency management, information technology, public finance, and constitutional law. Members also share an interest in improving both the policy process and the institutional structures through which issues and problems are addressed.

Forum members have contributed to public policy debates in Pennsylvania, and a number have also served in state and local government and in nonprofit and civic organizations that engage in policy development and implementation. Some members of the Forum are associated with other academic and public policy-related organizations, but the Forum itself is independent of these relationships and has no formal connections to any government entity. Members clearly benefit from the intellectual resources and environments of their universities, but unless otherwise indicated they do not act on behalf of their institutions when they sponsor Forum projects. The premise of the Forum is that through the consortium, members can jointly develop and sponsor nonpartisan research, symposiums, and education and training programs of value to elected officials, civic leaders, and the public and thereby enhance their ability to contribute to more intelligent and informed policy making.

PENNSYLVANIA POLICY FORUM
MEMBERSHIP (2016)

Theodore R. Alter, professor of agricultural, environmental, and regional economics, Pennsylvania State University

Michelle J. Atherton, associate director, Institute for Public Affairs, Temple University

Thomas J. Baldino, professor of political science, Wilkes University

Michael Cassidy, adjunct instructor of political science, Temple University

Beverly A. Cigler, professor of public policy and administration, Pennsylvania State University, Harrisburg

Richardson Dilworth, associate professor of political science and director of the Center for Public Policy, Drexel University

Michael R. Dimino, Sr., associate professor of law, Widener University Commonwealth Law School

(Chair) Paula Holoviak, professor of political science, Kutztown University

John J. Kennedy, associate professor of political science, West Chester University

Michael King, adjunct professor, Albright College and Temple University, and associate professor, Pennsylvania State University (retired)

Robin Lauermann, professor of politics and international relations, Messiah College

(Vice Chair) Joseph P. McLaughlin, Jr., director of the Institute for Public Affairs, Temple University

David Y. Miller, associate professor and director of the Innovation Clinic, Graduate School of Public and International Affairs, University of Pittsburgh

Randall M. Miller, professor of history, St. Joseph's University

Theresa Miller, director, Institute of Politics, University of Pittsburgh

Joseph Sabino Mistick, associate professor of law, Duquesne University School of Law

Richard A. Stafford, distinguished service professor of public policy, Heinz College, Carnegie Mellon University

David B. Thornburgh, executive director of the Committee of 70

Craig Wheeland, associate vice president for academic affairs and professor, Villanova University

Contents

Volume 18, Number 1 | June 2016 | ISSN 2469-7672

- **About the Authors**
- **COMMONWEALTH Matters** | *J. Wesley Leckrone, Editor-in-Chief*
- **An Introduction to the Special Issue on Education Policy**
| *Joseph P. McLaughlin, Jr., and Michelle J. Atherton*
- **COMMONWEALTH Forum: Should Pennsylvania Abolish the Property Tax for Schools?**

Yes, Abolish the Property Tax: It is the Worst Tax for Schools
| *David G. Argall and Jon Hopcraft*

No, Keep the Property Tax: It is the Best Tax for Schools
| *William A. Fischel*
- **What Would Student-Based Allocation Mean for Pennsylvania School Districts?** | *Marguerite Roza and Amanda Warco*
- **Higher Standards and Lower Achievement? An Evaluation of Pennsylvania's Keystone Exams** | *Adam McGlynn*
- **More Trouble Ahead for Public School Finance: The Implications of Generational Change in Pennsylvania**
| *Maureen W. McClure and Vera Krekanova*
- **Special Education Funding in Pennsylvania: The Effects of a Policy of Neglect** | *William T. Hartman*
- **The Education Policy Bookshelf: An Annotated Bibliography of Selected Studies** | *Meghan E. Rubado*

About the Authors

David G. Argall is a member of the Pennsylvania Senate and chair of the Senate Republican Policy Committee.

Michelle J. Atherton is the associate director of Temple University's Institute for Public Affairs and coeditor of the Special Issue on Education of *COMMONWEALTH: A Journal of Pennsylvania Politics and Policy*.

William A. Fischel is a professor of economics and Hardy Professor of Legal Studies at Dartmouth College.

William T. Hartman is a professor of education in the College of Education at Pennsylvania State University and a cofounder and executive director of the Center for Total Quality Schools at Penn State.

Jon Hopcraft is the director of the Senate Republican Policy Committee.

Vera Krekanova is the director of strategy and research for the Three Rivers Workforce Investment Board.

Maureen W. McClure is an associate professor of administrative and policy studies and senior research associate at the International Institute for Studies in Education in the School of Education at the University of Pittsburgh.

Adam McGlynn is an associate professor of political science at East Stroudsburg University of Pennsylvania.

Joseph P. McLaughlin, Jr., is the director of Temple University's Institute for Public Affairs and coeditor of the Special Issue on Education of *COMMONWEALTH: A Journal of Pennsylvania Politics and Policy*.

Marguerite Roza is the director of the Edunomics Lab at Georgetown University and a senior research affiliate at the Center on Reinventing Public Education.

Meghan E. Rubado is a graduate assistant at Temple University's Center on Regional Politics, housed within the Institute for Public Affairs, and a PhD candidate in Temple's Department of Political Science.

Amanda Warco is a research associate in the Edunomics Lab at Georgetown University.